

And since Spenser changes all the classical lists of virtues by adding Holiness to them, by presenting it first, and by illustrating it through a figure who is St. George, the patron saint of England, it seems clear to me that the poem is about, at least in part, the role of Elizabethan England in the history of salvation and the way in which an individual comes to participate in that role. That is to say, the controlling analogy, or allusion in the poem is the biblical, the Christian, which makes use of the classical, the mythological, and all the rest, but which is on a qualitatively different level from them. But that is my reading, and not Nohrberg's. Let it be sufficient to say that his scholarship is prodigious, his book monumental. We probably shall not see a study of this scope and detail again for some time to come.

JOHN N. WALL, JR.

North Carolina State University

Seeing with a Native Eye: Essays on Native American Religion. Edited by Walter Holden Capps. New York: Harper Forum Book, 1976, pp. viii + 132. \$3.95 (paper).

This paperback presents the papers given at a symposium on Native American religion sponsored by the Institute of Religious Studies at the University of California at Santa Barbara in January 1973. Among the participants in this venture were Barre Toelken, Joseph Epes Brown, Emory Sekaquaptewa, Scott Momaday, and Ake Hultkrantz — a formidable group well equipped to deal with the nuances of inter-cultural religious dialogue. A transcript of the panel discussion summarizing the symposium is included with the papers.

While this group made a valiant effort to come to grips with the nature of Indian religion, the papers as a whole reflect the confusion of radically differing epistemological premises which separate Native Americans and western Europeans. The Indian authors generally deal with religions from the basis of their own experience and thus avoid the cautious symbolic dimension which is traditional of the western mind. One encounters the reality of personal experience here but when the focus shifts toward a more fundamental and abstract understanding of the underlying principles of Indian religion the clarity becomes immersed in emotions and sensitivities. It is the nature of the beast and the Indian participants are not to be faulted.

Hultkrantz suggests a basic revision of certain categories of the phenomenology of religion and while his suggestions are a welcome recognition of the reality and substance of non-western religions, they also betray an academic fascination with classification that keeps religious experience at arm's length and serve to lead the discussion away from the vital confrontation which the material suggests is possible. Of more denigrating nature is Joseph Epes Brown's continual insistence that Indian religion is a matter of belief rather than expe-

rience and it is difficult to conceive that a generation ago Brown spent some important months with the Sioux holy man Black Elk since his viewpoint reflects little of the richness contained in the Black Elk memoirs as recorded by Niehardt and Brown.

The volume has value in spite of the editor's insistence that Carlos Castaneda's works be accorded the same status as other writings by and about Indians. To knowledgeable people in the field this elevation of Castaneda smacks of naïve youth rather than a mature command of the field and perhaps that atmosphere is what troubles one about the volume. Certainly more direct and useful confrontations between the two traditions can be generated which would provide the thoughtful reader with food for meditation and reflection. If nothing else the book indicates the very real problems which inter-cultural discussions can display without a common and definitive work in the field which transcends traditional lines of classification used by the history of religion people. This volume may inspire others to attempt to tread the same ground and avoid the problems of communication so evident in this symposium. Considering that this symposium is one of the first to bring the best minds in the field into contact with one another, it is a well chosen first step in understanding.

VINE DELORIA, JR.

University of Arizona

Paul Tillich, His Life and Thought. Vol. I: Life. By Wilhelm and Marion Pauck. New York, Hagerstown, San Francisco, London: Harper & Row, 1976, pp. xii + 340. \$15.00.

Death takes a man away from the living and gives in return his completed image. We see him for the first time in his entirety only when he is no longer alive. The many facets of Tillich's kaleidoscopic image are mirrored in countless words spoken and written after his death.

Appearing ten years after Paul Tillich's death, this book (from whose concluding paragraphs the preceding sentences are taken) may be seen as welcome added words further amplifying our picture of one of the truly outstanding philosopher-theologians of this and many more centuries. It may also be regarded as the final and ultimate word, the word which embraces and completes all others so far as the biography of Paul Tillich is concerned. If any may be so courageous (or even foolhardy) as to attempt another full scale biography of the life of Tillich in the future, one feels strongly that it would only be as a retouching or a copy of a portrait already brilliantly and even definitively painted by Wilhelm and Marion Pauck.

The first of two projected volumes by the Paucks, this "Life" is principally the work of Marion Hausner Pauck, though constant collaboration by both is